3-2015

Reversing Stereotypes: The Good Black Man America Has Yet to Know

Alexandria Harris
Pepperdine University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.pepperdine.edu/sturesearch

Part of the Political Science Commons

Recommended Citation
https://digitalcommons.pepperdine.edu/sturesearch/108

This Senior Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Undergraduate Student Research at Pepperdine Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Featured Research by an authorized administrator of Pepperdine Digital Commons. For more information, please contact Katrina.Gallardo@pepperdine.edu, anna.speth@pepperdine.edu.
Author’s Note: This paper was written in partial fulfillment of the requirements for Bachelor of Arts in Political Science with Honors.

Abstract: Research has shown that the negative stereotypes of black masculinity prevalent in American public opinion are linked to negative media portrayals of African American men. Using both theming analysis and survey experiment methods, I ask whether or not positive media portrayals of African American men offset negative stereotypes of black masculinity. The central finding is that one-time exposure to positive media portrayals of African American men decrease levels of racial resentment. I then close by considering the implications the results have on media portrayals as well as opinions of ordinary citizens.
Introduction

During the aftermath of the police shooting of eighteen-year-old Michael Brown, the streets of Ferguson, Missouri were filled with riots and civil unrest. In light of these events, a lively discussion ensued about Highway Patrol Captain Ronald Johnson’s ability to bring peace to Ferguson. While his uniform places him in a position that grants him authority, he contends that he is much more than an officer. In a CNN press conference Johnson told reporters, “I’m a man first, a black man second, I’m a husband, I’m a father, I’m a son. A trooper? There [are] a lot of things I am before I’m a trooper” (DiBlasio 2014). Johnson embodies a good side of black masculinity that is often overshadowed in society by the bad. In this paper, I ask whether or not positive media portrayals of African American men can offset the stereotypes of bad black masculinity prevalent in American public opinion.

In order to do so, I utilize the insights of identity and social theories. Masculinity theory posits that men engage in gender performance behavior out of necessity in order to feel masculine (Rich 2014). Whereas black masculinity is seen as animalistic and violent, white masculinity is considered the hegemonic faction in American society and is described as being appropriately violent (Cooper 2009b; Harris 2000; Hooks 2004). Cultivation theory explores the ways in which television media impact viewers’ conception of the real world (Gillian and Iyengar 2000; Oliver 2003). Together, these theories help explain media’s ability to encourage negative stereotypes and resentment towards African American men and black masculinity.

While current masculinity literature clearly defines what it means to embody bad black masculinity, there is no concrete definition of what qualities comprise good black masculinity (but see Cooper 2009a). Furthermore, cultivation literature has reported the impact media portrayals of bad black masculinity have on viewers yet has not looked at the impact good black
masculinity portrayals have, presumably in part due to the lack of such portrayals. I seek to fill this gap by defining good black masculinity and analyzing the effects it has on viewers when covered in media content (White 2007). Masculinity and Cultivation theories suggest that African American men are not always free to construct a new identity outside of the one society has already constructed for them. However, I argue that several black men have created an identity for themselves apart from stereotypes and it is simply a matter of society acknowledging that identity as present. Do positive portrayals alter the way the public views African American men?

I address my research question by employing both theming analysis and experimental research methods. In order to conceptualize good black masculinity, I first examine media portrayals of good black men. I then pull various themes from the content and ultimately use those themes to define good black masculinity. Next, I examine the effects of news coverage that employs this standard of positive black masculinity to both white and black men. I do so via an experiment using Pepperdine University undergraduate students as my research population to show how good and bad black masculinities influence opinions among the public.

The results of the survey experiment show that one-time exposure to a positive media portrayal of African American men decreased the amount of racial resentment individuals held. The findings are important because negative media portrayals have consistently have a powerful effect on public opinion and racial resentment towards African American males specifically (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Oliver 2003; Oliver and Fonash 2002). This study then, offers positive media portrayals as a way to offset negative stereotypes of black masculinity. Positive media portrayals may also impact the way the media portrays African American men and in turn transform the way viewers see them.
I proceed by reviewing literature from both masculinity studies and cultivation theory. After filling the gap in the literature by defining positive black masculinity, I outline my hypothesis concerning the effects of positive portrayals of black masculinity in the media. I then test my hypothesis using a survey experiment. After assessing the results, I conclude with a discussion of the broader implications my findings have on American society and public opinion.

**Literature Overview of Masculinity Studies and Cultivation Theory**

While masculinity studies examine the behaviors of both white and black males, cultivation theory explains the ways in which media portrayals prime negative stereotypes that shape American public opinion.

**What is black masculinity?**

According to masculinity theory, masculine identities transform the way men view themselves and in turn, act. Masculinity theory asserts, “men, in order to feel like men or feel masculine, must engage in gender performance behavior” (Rich 2014, 1039). Manliness and violence go hand in hand but African American males and violence are entirely inseparable (Harris 2000; Rich 2014). Hooks goes as far as to say, “read any article or book on black masculinity and it will convey the message that black men are violent” (2004, 47). The portrayal of African American males as the ‘black violent beasts’ is far from new (Hooks 2004). Over the years, media content has played a substantial role in furthering these negative sentiments of black males as violent (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Oliver 2003). Whereas black masculinity is seen as animalistic and violent, white masculinity is considered the hegemonic faction in American society and is described as being appropriately violent (Cooper 2009b; Harris 2000;
Hooks 2004). Both masculinities are generally seen as one-sided but black masculinity is seen as bad whereas white masculinity is seen as good. Given that one stereotype or media portrayal cannot do justice to an entire race, I offer an increase in positive media portrayals of black men as a means to offset this one-sided depiction.

Scholars agree that many African American males have conveyed a good side to black masculinity (Cooper 2009a; Hooks 2004). Martin Luther King Jr., W.E.B. Du Bois, Malcom X, and President Barack Obama are a few of many who have broken free from the stigmatized chains of black masculinity. Scholars believe that men have the ability to be the “comforting and assimilationist Good Black Man” over the “race-affirming Bad Black Man” by choosing with which gender identity they want to identify (Cooper 2009a, 633). The gender continuum ranges from nurturing feminine qualities on one end to competitive hierarchical masculine qualities on the other (Cooper 2009a). Cooper argues that President Barack Obama is a prime example of good black masculinity by being our first “unisex” president (2009a). This unisex identity allows Obama to demand the respect of the people through a very calm and nurturing demeanor.

Although Cooper has taken a step in the right direction by highlighting a positive side of black masculinity, it is unfavorable to say a man must adopt feminine qualities in order to achieve good black masculinity. Thus, the notion of good black masculinity is redefined in my inquiry. As with any race, it is clear that there are both good and bad sides of black masculinity, but it is also clear that overrepresentation of the bad side of black masculinity in media coverage belittles the good.

These bipolar depictions of African American males leave us with two separate identities. On one hand a glowing representation of the good African American in all his accomplishments exists and on the other the ungrateful bad African American is represented who refuses to
assimilate into a more proper culture (Cooper 2009a). Masculinity theories explain why men tend to engage in certain behaviors. However, it is one-sided negative media content that leads the public to believe those behaviors are true for every male in an entire racialized group. In this paper I utilize cultivation theory to further this point.

**Why does cultivation matter?**

The negative sentiment of black males as criminal and dangerous has expanded far beyond police officers, reaching almost all of society. People have become very fearful when in the presence of black males; white women walk on the other side of the street to avoid making contact and clerks keep an eye on them to make sure they do not shoplift (Oliver 2003). Many scholars have found that this phenomenon can be explained, at least partly, by media portrayals of black males through the application of cultivation theory, that is the idea that the more television people watch the more they come to view the real world as the same (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Oliver 2003; Oliver and Fonash 2002; Romer, Jamieson and Aday 2003; see also Bailey 2006). Scholars have also applied cultivation theory to explain the effects of negative media portrayals of immigrants (Esses, Medianu and Lawson 2013; Igartua, Barrios and Ortega 2012). Researcher George Gerbner introduced the idea of cultivation in the 1960s as a way to analyze the impacts of television on viewer’s conception of the real world (Morgan, Shanahan and Signorielli 2009; Morgan and Shanahan 2010; Oliver 2003). Gerbner hypothesized that the more time one spends watching television, the more one is prone to think that the real world is very much the same, “even though the two may be widely divergent” (Oliver 2003, 8). One may think that in such a work driven society television ought be a positive outlet, freeing people from
their busy minds. However, the selectivity of roles has proved to hold negative affects on viewers’ conception of other races, predominately African Americans and their role as criminals.

I. African Americans’ Role in Television Media

Over the years many scholars have examined the intersection of race and crime in media portrayals (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Oliver 2003). Oliver argues that media portrayals of crime and viewers’ behavioral reactions are vital components to furthering stereotypes of black men as “criminal and dangerous” (2003, 4), namely, as thieves and rapists. More often than not, the media portrays blacks as perpetrators and whites as heroes. Furthermore blacks are depicted as involved with violent criminal acts more often than nonviolent (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Oliver 2003). Oliver reports, “84% of all crime stories about black suspects pertained to violent rather than nonviolent crime, compared to 71% of crime stories about white suspects” (2003, 6). This pattern of coverage cultivates the notion that blacks are not only violent, but they are by far more violent than any other race. Since most people get their information from media portrayals as opposed to real life experiences, viewers tend to accept what media presents to them as the truth and the whole truth at that (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000). Although there is some truth to media content, scholars have exposed several disparities between media content and the real world. For example, studies have shown that blacks do not make-up the largest group convicted for committing murder. In fact minorities account for the largest amount of nonviolent as opposed to violent felonies (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000). Despite the truth-value these media portrayals may or may not hold, there is no question that they have subsequent effects on the viewer.
II. Impact of Negative Media Portrayals on Viewers’ Perception of the Real World

Scholars have found that criminal media portrayals have several effects on viewers. The first effect is that viewers think that crime rates in the real world are much higher than they actually are (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Morgan and Shanahan 2010; Oliver 2003; Romer, Jamieson and Aday 2003). Studies have shown that reality television programs account for this sort of cultivation more so than fictional programs (Oliver 2003; Morgan and Shanahan 2010), presumably in part due to the fact that fictional programs are less likely to contain negative portrayals (Oliver 2003). The second effect is that viewers live in a state of fear that they themselves will be victimized (Romer, Jamieson and Aday 2003; Morgan and Shanahan 2010). The third effect is that viewers misattribute race to violent and nonviolent criminal suspects (Oliver 2003; Oliver and Fonash 2002). Oliver and Fonash found that whites are more likely to misattribute race to the suspect when the individuals are the same race (2002). The fourth effect is that viewers resultantly opt for harsher punishment and policies (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Morgan, Shanahan and Signorielli 2009). Lastly, the fifth and most applicable effect is viewers increasingly negative attitudes towards minorities, specifically blacks (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Oliver 2003; Oliver and Fonash 2002). While the effects of negative portrayals are clear, the effects of positive portrayals have gone unstudied.

To reiterate, masculinity theories help us understand the implications of being black and male in American society. Furthermore, cultivation theory answers why bad black masculinity remains a stereotype in society today, despite many black men’s ability to break free of their stigmatized chains and become upstanding members of society. Literature has yet to define good black masculinity, presumably in part due to the lack thereof in media content, and it has yet to explore the effects positive black masculinity has on viewers.
Research Design

This paper seeks to define positive black masculinity and explore the effects media portrayals of positive black masculinity have on viewers’ attitudes toward African American males. I seek to answer the following question: Do positive portrayals of African American men offset negative stereotypes of black masculinity prevalent in American public opinion? To study the effects of positive media portrayals I employ both theming analysis and an experimental survey.

In order to conceptualize positive black masculinity I examined media content through the means of theming analysis, defined as combining repeated concepts after having read article or blog content (see Mills, Durepos, and Wiebe 2010; Ortbals 2014; Saldaña 2009). I began the analysis by gathering data from websites, specifically Facebook pages, YouTube videos, blogs, news articles and organizations that have discussed what it means to be a good black man, in the past two years (2013-2014). After examining all of the given content, I found five repeated themes, which I use to define good black masculinity.

By far the two most prominent themes that set good black men apart from their negative stereotypes are being family oriented and role models. A good black man who is family oriented does not use unnecessary force or violence to discipline his wife or children. Furthermore, he is actively involved in his children’s lives and present whenever they may need him. Similarly, a good black male may act as a role model to the black male youth in his community even if he does not have children of his own. In order to act as a role model he must display confidence, self-esteem, and success. A good black male that portrays confidence can generally be characterized by the way that he carries himself and dresses. ¹ Additionally, a good black male

¹ The specific attire a good black male should wear is widely debated. In this paper, I simply mean that he is dressed appropriately, in either casual or business clothes, depending on the context.
who is said to have self-esteem perceives himself to be just as capable as any other male. A man of such character does not let the stereotypes attached to the color of his skin define him. Perhaps the most important quality a role model must have is that he be successful. That is to say that he is constantly pursuing his career goals and aspirations; in essence, he is always working towards a goal. Thus, in this paper I take black men to embody positive black masculinity when they are both family oriented and active role models by being confident, having self-esteem, and being successful (see Appendix A).

I used this definition of positive black masculinity to test the impacts of positive media portrayals of black men using a survey experiment. The survey was administered in January of 2015, using Pepperdine University undergraduate students taking the Political Science 104 general education courses. The experimental manipulation consisted of a fabricated newspaper story that reports on an incident in which an individual gets robbed by an armed robber and a bystander rescues the individual, staying with him until the paramedics arrive. Subjects were randomly selected into one of the four conditions (see Appendix B). Some read a story in which a black male is the suspect in an armed robbery (Negative Black Masculinity). In this brief story the suspect embodies negative black masculinity by being a violent criminal. Others read an identical story except that a black male bystander acts as a Good Samaritan, saving the victim from the armed robber (Positive Black Masculinity). The heroic bystander exemplifies positive black masculinity by being confident enough to save the victim despite the dangers of an armed robber. The fact that this man was on his way home from work, heading to his daughter’s soccer game implies that he is both family-oriented and successful. Although not explicitly stated, it is inferred that the heroic bystander embodies traits of positive black masculinity by being a role model who has self-esteem. The first control group read a story with identical content but was
not told the race of the suspect (*No Race*), whereas the second control group did not read a story at all (*No Story*). The story is identical in all of the conditions, apart from the attributed race (see Appendix C for full stories). In order to keep the stories consistent, the robbery suspect exercises traits of bad black masculinity, despite the attributed race. In like manner, the bystander exercises qualities of good black masculinity despite his given race.

The manipulation occurred in the context of a questionnaire filled out in class (see Appendix D for the full questionnaire). The questionnaire begins with two political questions that were not specifically race-based to provide some distraction from the race-based nature of the experiment. The questionnaire then includes one of the four stories, followed by seven distractor questions about a fictitious political candidate and concludes with ten questions, including six items that make up the racial resentment scale (Kinder and Sanders 1996). In addition to the racial resentment scale the questionnaire included four distractor questions about Barack Obama and Congress.

In this experiment, media content acts as the independent variable and should be taken to mean print media, more specifically the fabricated news story presented to each subject. Additionally, racial resentment acts as the dependent variable. Kinder and Sanders measure of racial resentment is different than that of racial prejudice (1996). Racial resentment as a measure “powerfully predicts derogatory racial stereotypes, which are often thought to be the core of prejudice… but distinct from, biological forms of racism” (Kinder and Sanders 1996, 109). All respondents were asked how strongly they agree or disagree with the following six statements from the racial resentment scale:

*Most blacks who receive money from welfare programs could get along without it if they tried. (Welfare)*

*Over the past years, blacks have gotten less than they deserve. (Deserve)*
Government officials usually pay less attention to a request or complaint from a black person than from a white person. (Officials)

Irish, Italian, Jewish and many other minorities overcame prejudice and worked their way up. Blacks should do the same without any special favors. (Favors)

It’s really a matter of some people not trying hard enough; if blacks would only try harder they could be just as well off as whites. (Harder)

Generations of slavery and discrimination have created conditions that make it difficult for blacks to work their way out of the lower class. (Conditions)

The racial resentment scale yielded responses ranging from “agree strongly” to “disagree strongly.” The racial resentment scale is carefully designed to identify subject’s racial resentment toward African American men in both a subtle and symbolic manner. Kinder and Sanders (1996) refer to this as symbolic racism. They argue that people are no longer willing to assert that they view other races as inferior. However, whites continue to hold stigmatized views toward racial minorities (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Kinder and Sanders 1996). New or symbolic racism is said to be “associated with complaints about society as a whole and with endorsement of traditional American values, while on the other hand, it was utterly related to whatever personal dissatisfactions white suburbanites felt about their own communities, jobs, schools or personal safety” (Kinder and Sanders 1996, 291). Thus, white Americans have adopted a view of how Americans should behave and how society ought to work. When reality does not align with their notions they place blame on those who do not fit their idealistic mold, those typically being African Americans and other minority groups. Given that prior studies only show that negative media portrayals of black masculinity increase racial resentment (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Oliver 2003), I used the racial resentment scale to test the effects of positive media portrayals of black masculinity on levels of racial resentment.
Along with the six questions pertaining to racial resentment, respondents were asked four additional opinion-based questions regarding a number of political issues. The sole purpose of the additional questions was to lessen the chances of respondents recognizing the purpose of the survey and these questions were not used for further analysis. This experiment allows me to test the following hypothesis:

Hypothesis: Subjects in the Positive Black Masculinity condition should hold less racial resentment than those selected into the Negative Black Masculinity condition.

If positive media portrayals do not affect levels of racial resentment, there should be no difference between the amount of racial resentment held by those that receive the Positive Black Masculinity condition and those that receive the Negative Black Masculinity condition. In contrast, if positive media portrayals do affect levels of racial resentment, those who receive the positive condition should score lower on the racial resentment scale than those who receive the negative condition.

Results

The survey yielded 186 responses. However I removed international students’ survey responses due to the possibility of their being unfamiliar with American politics, leaving 156 responses. There were no statistically significant demographic or political differences between the four conditions in terms of party identification, ideology and sex (see Appendix E). Four out of the six racial resentment questions were highly intercorrelated: deserves, favors, harder and conditions, while two others were not. It is unclear why the two remaining questions (welfare and officials) did not fit well with the others. I combined the four correlated items via principle

---

2 Principal components factor analysis retained two primary factors with eigenvalues over 1 (3.01 and 1.04). The first only accounted for 50 percent of the variance while the second accounted for 17 percent.
components factor analysis and rescaled the variable to a 0-100 racial resentment scale: 0 being the lowest level of racial resentment to 100 being the highest level of racial resentment.

The results suggest that the two treatment conditions, the No Story and the No Race conditions, exhibit about the same levels of racial resentment (see Figure 1). This allows me to treat them as a combined controlled group. Respondents who received the Negative Black Masculinity story held an average level of 55.6 on the resentment scale, which is higher than any other condition. This finding suggests that negative media portrayals may increase individual’s level of racial resentment. In contrast, those who received the Positive Black Masculinity frame held on average a score of 46.7, the lowest of any of the four conditions in terms of racial

---

Eigenvectors for welfare and officials were .36 and .37, compared to eigenvectors above .40 for the other four. Principal components analysis of the four items retained only 1 eigenvalue over 1 (the second factor had an eigenvalue of .72). The eigenvectors of the four variables were .51, .50, .50, and .49.
resentment. The difference in racial resentment between the positive and negative conditions is close to significant ($p = .11$, all tests two-tailed). This finding suggests that positive media portrayals may not only serve to offset negative stereotypes, but they may also lead to levels of resentment below that of the population’s base levels. More specifically, the racial resentment among the Positive Black Masculinity condition is estimated to be 3.7 points lower than the mean racial resentment level in the No Race condition and 5.2 points lower than No Article condition, though these differences fall short of statistical significance.

Table 1 Impact of Positive Media Portrayals of Black Men on Racial Resentment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditions</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Negative Black Masculinity</td>
<td>3.23</td>
<td>(4.55)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive Black Masculinity</td>
<td>-7.47</td>
<td>(4.49)*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Race</td>
<td>-3.40</td>
<td>(4.58)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Controls**

| Party Identification             | -4.00    | (1.70)** |          |
| Ideology                         | -7.51    | (2.17)***|          |
| Black Respondent                 | -7.53    | (6.36)   |          |
| CONSTANT                         | 84.58    | (5.63)***|          |

$R^2$ 0.29  
$N$ 156

Note: * $p<0.1$; ** $p<0.05$; *** $p<0.01$; standard errors in parentheses

In order to obtain a more precise estimate of the effects of positive portrayals of black
masculinity, I adjusted for three covariates: individual’s party identification, ideology and if the respondent was Black, using ordinary least squares regression (see Table 1). The results show with greater confidence that the *Positive Black Masculinity* story decreased the amount of racial resentment among subjects, relative to the control group (p < .10). To illustrate, Figure 2 shows that, all else equal, subjects given the *Positive Black Masculinity* condition estimated to be 7.5 points lower on the racial resentment scale than the combined control groups. This difference is statistically significant (at the .10 level). The *Negative Black Masculinity* condition estimated to be 3.2 points higher than the combined controlled groups. This difference is not statistically significant. On the other hand, levels of racial resentment among subjects in the *Positive Black Masculinity* condition is estimated to be 10.7 points lower than that of subjects in the *Negative Black Masculinity* condition. This difference is statistically significant (p < .05).

These results indicate that media portrayals had an effect on individuals’ opinions, even for college students who are presumably less willing than the rest of the population to hold and express
racial resentment. In a more representative sample outside of the university setting, this experiment might reveal even greater effects amongst the public. Through the success of positive media portrayals of African American men to reduce levels of racial resentment, my results show that even one-time exposure to a brief article had an effect on the levels of racial resentment. Repeated and deeper exposure may exert even stronger effects on individual’s racial resentment.

Conclusion

Whereas previous studies have shown that negative media portrayals of African American men lead to increased amounts of racial resentment (Gilliam and Iyengar 2000; Oliver 2003; Oliver and Fonash 2002; Romer, Jamieson and Aday 2003; Morgan and Shanahan 2010), this study shows that positive media portrayals can help decrease levels of racial resentment. Prior studies have made reference to the good side of black masculinity (Cooper 2009a; Hooks 2004), but up until now work on the subject has not been extensive. This study highlights positive media portrayals as a possible solution to offsetting negative stereotypes. Furthermore, this study shows that one-time exposure to a positive media portrayal has the ability to decrease individuals’ levels of racial resentment.

On a broader scale, these results suggest that media coverage of black men potentially affect the way Americans across the country view African American men. More specifically, positive media coverage of African American men may decrease levels of racial resentment amongst the public. Encouraging viewers to recognize the good side of black masculinity through the means of media content may also offset the one-sided depiction of African American males. Ultimately, positive media portrayals of black men may influence people to think twice before labeling a black male with negative stereotypes.
This experiment, like most, has a few limitations. Due to the fact that the test population consists of college students from one university it can in no way be considered a representative sample of the entire American population. However, it is just as important to note that these results can be replicated on a more representative population in the future. Another limitation is that black masculinity traits are attributed to both white and black men in the faux news articles. White masculinity is considered the hegemonic faction in American society and white males are seen as appropriately violent, whereas black masculinity is considered animalistic and overly violent (Cooper 2009b; Harris 2000; Hooks 2004). Both masculinities are generally seen as one-sided but black masculinity is seen as bad whereas white masculinity is seen as good. Given that white and black masculinities are different, further studies might choose to utilize separate faux articles for the different types of masculinity. However, the faux news stories used are effective for this particular study since the only difference between the experimental conditions is whether subjects saw a positive or negative portrayal of black masculinity. This method isolates the causal effect of positive media portrayals of black masculinity.

This study shows that media portrayals are powerful and have the ability to affect individuals’ level of racial resentment. Further research is necessary and should continue in order to find the exact effects positive media portrayals of black men would have on the American population as a whole, along with potential jurors, police officers, and news reporters. Additional research is also necessary to understand the duration of these effects. The results of such research would help us better understand the best ways in which media portrayals can help offset negative stereotypes of black men.
Appendices

Appendix A: Positive Black Masculinity Themes
### Appendix B: Fabricated News Stories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Supporting Quotes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family Oriented</td>
<td>A man who does not use violence or force to discipline his wife or children and is actively involved in his family’s lives.</td>
<td>“This is the love of my life, my daughter Jay.””</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“Daddy’s got you. That’s all that’s important.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“We need more men to get in the mindset of supporting women and picking them up instead of being pimps and playas that try to smash everything in sight.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role Model</td>
<td>A man who emphasizes the importance of contrasting negative stereotypes through his actions and speech.</td>
<td>“I need you working with me and me working with you on how we raise our sons and teach them to be men.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“Teaching young men to value the models of maleness”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“Stop neglecting male friendships, find good role models to look up to.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence</td>
<td>Confidence is an implicit quality that men display in the way they carry themselves. This can also be seen in the way a man dresses.</td>
<td>“Confidence within me that allows me to feel as if I am just as competent as anyone else in this world.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“Stop speaking negative about myself and others around me... I had to force myself to stop saying I couldn’t or that I am not good enough”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“Black boys should want to hold their heads up and be proud and confident in their abilities”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Esteem</td>
<td>A man who does not allow his past or the color of his skin to define him. Rather he takes himself to be just as capable as any other man and does not need to engage in masculinity contests to prove it.</td>
<td>“We have within our power as a society to topple barriers to equal opportunity for everyone, including African-American men and boys”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“Self-esteem is something that comes from within you... It’s one of those things you have to work at daily, especially initially.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Oriented</td>
<td>A man who is either working towards or has accomplished career goals.</td>
<td>“I have integrity, goals, and aspirations to be good- I am good”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“Ensure that everything you do, from the way you perform on your job to how you dress, is consistent with the personal brand.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the Condition</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Theoretical Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Condition 1:</td>
<td>Subjects read a story in which a black male acts as the heroic</td>
<td>Subjects who receive the Positive Black Masculinity condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive Black Masculinity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condition 1: Positive Black Masculinity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Santa Monica Surfside Times</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good Samaritan saves victim from armed robbery downtown.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By John Alford</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 15, 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOS ANGELES—The victim Jesse Smith, a 45-year-old male, was said to have been leaving the automatic teller machine when the suspect confronted him. The suspect held him at gunpoint and demanded his money. The suspect threatened to shoot Smith if he did not hand over his wallet. When Smith refused, the suspect bashed him in the head with his gun.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seconds later bystander Adam Thompson, a 30-year-old black male, came onto the scene. Upon seeing Thompson, the suspect grabbed Smith’s wallet and fled the scene. Thompson rushed over to aid Smith and immediately called the police. Thompson waited with Smith until the paramedics and police arrived. He even rode with Smith to the hospital and offered to take him home once he was released. Smith received five stitches for the gash in his head but did not suffer from any major injuries.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thompson was on his way home from work at a local law office and on his way to his daughter’s soccer game when he saw the confrontation occurring. Smith told the police, “I have never met a man as nice as Thompson. Nowadays most people don’t even stop to help when they see a crime taking place let alone stay with the victim to make sure he is okay. His confidence reassured me that I was going to be okay. The world could really use more people like Thompson.” The suspect is described as being a white male in his mid 20’s, about 5’10” to 6 feet tall with a medium build. He was reportedly wearing a dark-colored hoodie with jeans, sunglasses and a red bandana.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With the help of the victim, police were later able to identify the suspect as 25-year-old Joshua Miller, a wanted criminal for two other bank robberies in the area.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Condition 2: Negative Black Masculinity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subjects read a story in which a black male acts as the suspect in an armed robbery and a white male acts as a heroic bystander.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subjects who receive the Negative Black Masculinity condition should hold higher levels of racial resentment than those who receive the Positive Black Masculinity condition.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Condition 3: No Race</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subjects read a story in which neither the race of the suspect nor the heroic bystander is disclosed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No impact anticipated.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Condition 4: No Story</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subjects asked the questionnaire without reading a story.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No impact anticipated.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Appendix C: Fabricated Newspaper Articles**
Condition 2: Negative Black Masculinity

*Santa Monica Surfside Times*

Good Samaritan saves victim from armed robbery downtown.

By John Alford

January 15, 2015

LOS ANGELES—The victim Jesse Smith, a 45-year-old male, was said to have been leaving the automatic teller machine when the suspect confronted him. The suspect held him at gunpoint and demanded his money. The suspect threatened to shoot Smith if he did not hand over his wallet. When Smith refused, the suspect bashed him in the head with his gun.

Seconds later bystander Adam Thompson, a 30-year-old white male, came onto the scene. Upon seeing Thompson, the suspect grabbed Smith’s wallet and fled the scene. Thompson rushed over to aid Smith and immediately called the police. Thompson waited with Smith until the paramedics and police arrived. He even rode with Smith to the hospital and offered to take him home once he was released. Smith received five stitches for the gash in his head but did not suffer from any major injuries.

Thompson was on his way home from work at a local law office and on his way to his daughter’s soccer game when he saw the confrontation occurring. Smith told the police, “I have never met a man as nice as Thompson. Nowadays most people don’t even stop to help when they see a crime taking place let alone stay with the victim to make sure he is okay. His confidence reassured me that I was going to be okay. The world could really use more people like Thompson.” The suspect is described as being a black male in his mid 20’s, about 5’10” to 6 feet tall with a medium build. He was reportedly wearing a dark-colored hoodie with jeans, sunglasses and a red bandana.

With the help of the victim, police were later able to identify the suspect as 25-year-old Joshua Miller, a wanted criminal for two other bank robberies in the area.

Condition 3: No Race
Appendix D: Survey Questionnaire

Please answer the following questions by circling the response that best matches your view. Answers will remain anonymous.

Think about the following statement: “People like me have no say about what the government does.” Do you (circle one)

1) Agree strongly
2) Agree somewhat
3) Neither agree nor disagree
4) Disagree somewhat
5) Disagree strongly

Think about the following statement: “Sometimes, politics and government seem so complicated that a person like me can't really understand what's going on.” Do you (circle one)

1) Agree strongly
2) Agree somewhat
3) Neither agree nor disagree
4) Disagree somewhat
5) Disagree strongly

We are interested in how people process information. Please read the following news article closely.

<<Fabricated news article placed here>>
Before the congressional elections last fall, a newspaper in another state provided summaries of the local congressional candidates’ biographies to its readers. We have copied one of these candidate summaries below. Please read the summary carefully and then answer the questions that follow.

David Jones is a local business owner who is running for political office for the first time. He holds a Bachelor’s degree in Communications from the University of Illinois. Last year, Jones’ tax return indicated that his income was $3 million. Mr. Jones previously served on the County Planning Commission and he currently sits on the Board of the Arts Commission. He is married with two children.

For the following questions, please give us your best guess based on the information about the candidate you just read.

If this candidate were running for Congress in your district, which of the following do you think would come closest to your view?

1) I would definitely not vote for this candidate.
2) I would probably not vote for this candidate.
3) I would probably vote for this candidate.
4) I would definitely vote for this candidate.

How well do you think this candidate would represent you in office?

1) Very well
2) Somewhat well
3) Somewhat poorly
4) Very poorly

Based on what you know about this candidate, in your opinion, how well do the following phrases describe him?

He would provide strong leadership

1) Extremely well
2) Very well
3) Moderately well
4) Slightly well
5) Not well at all

He really cares about people like you

1) Extremely well
2) Very well
3) Moderately well
4) Slightly well
5) Not well at all

He is honest

1) Extremely well
2) Very well
3) Moderately well
4) Slightly well
5) Not well at all

He is intelligent
1) Extremely well
2) Very well
3) Moderately well
4) Slightly well
5) Not well at all

Based on what you know about this candidate, what political party do you think this candidate is a member of?
1) Democratic Party
2) Green Party
3) Libertarian Party
4) Republican Party
5) Socialist Party

Based on the news article you read please answer the question below.

Please identify the race of the robbery suspect.
1) White
2) Black
3) Hispanic
4) Asian
5) Don’t Know

Now we are interested in your thoughts on a variety of political issues.

Most blacks who receive money from welfare programs could get along without it if they tried.
1) Agree strongly
2) Agree somewhat
3) Neither agree nor disagree
4) Disagree somewhat
5) Disagree strongly

Do you approve or disapprove of the way Barack Obama is handling his job as president?
1) Approve strongly
2) Approve moderately
3) Disapprove moderately
4) Disapprove strongly

Over the past few years, blacks have gotten less than they deserve.
1) Agree strongly
2) Agree somewhat  
3) Neither agree nor disagree  
4) Disagree somewhat  
5) Disagree strongly

Do you approve or disapprove of the way Congress is handling its job?  
1) Approve strongly  
2) Approve moderately  
3) Disapprove moderately  
4) Disapprove strongly

Government officials usually pay less attention to a request or complaint from a black person than from a white person.  
1) Agree strongly  
2) Agree somewhat  
3) Neither agree nor disagree  
4) Disagree somewhat  
5) Disagree strongly

How do you feel about the Affordable Care Act, also known as Obamacare?  
1) Favor a great deal  
2) Favor moderately  
3) Favor a little  
4) Neither favor nor oppose  
5) Oppose a little  
6) Oppose moderately  
7) Oppose a great deal

Irish, Italian, Jewish and many other minorities overcame prejudice and worked their way up. Blacks should do the same without any special favors.  
1) Agree strongly  
2) Agree somewhat  
3) Neither agree nor disagree  
4) Disagree somewhat  
5) Disagree strongly

As you may know, a majority of members of Congress are millionaires. Which of the following comes closest to your view of the fact that this many members of Congress are millionaires?  
1) It is a very significant problem  
2) It is a somewhat significant problem  
3) It is a small problem  
4) It is not a problem at all, but it is not a good thing either.  
5) It is a slightly good thing.  
6) It is a somewhat good thing.
7) It is a very good thing
In past studies, researchers have asked people why they think white people seem to get more of the good things in life in America—such as better jobs and more money—than black people do. These are two of the reasons given by both blacks and whites. Please respond with your personal opinion.

It’s really a matter of some people not trying hard enough; if blacks would only try harder they could be just as well off as whites.
   1) Agree strongly
   2) Agree somewhat
   3) Neither agree nor disagree
   4) Disagree somewhat
   5) Disagree strongly

Generations of slavery and discrimination have created conditions that make it difficult for blacks to work their way out of the lower class.
   1) Agree strongly
   2) Agree somewhat
   3) Neither agree nor disagree
   4) Disagree somewhat
   5) Disagree strongly

Generally speaking, do you consider yourself a
   1) Republican
   2) Independent leaning Republican
   3) Independent
   4) Independent leaning Democrat
   5) Democrat

Generally speaking, do your political views tend to be
   1) Very conservative
   2) Somewhat conservative
   3) Moderate
   4) Somewhat liberal
   5) Very liberal

Finally, please tell us about your demographics.

Gender: Please specify your gender
   1) Male
   2) Female

Ethnicity: Please specify your ethnicity.
   1) White
   2) Hispanic or Latino
   3) Black or African American
   4) Native American or American Indian
5) Asian/Pacific Islander
6) Other

Which of the following best describes you?
   1) International Student
   2) Student from the U.S.

Appendix E: Summary Statistics by Condition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Negative Masculinity</th>
<th>Positive Masculinity</th>
<th>No Race</th>
<th>No Story</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Party Identification</td>
<td>2.46</td>
<td>2.55</td>
<td>2.49</td>
<td>2.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideology</td>
<td>2.86</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td>2.69</td>
<td>2.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% women</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cells present the mean for each condition.
Party Identification ranges from 1 (Republican) to 5 (Democrat).
Ideology ranges from 1 (very conservative) to 5 (very liberal).
Differences of means tests between conditions are all statistically insignificant at the .05 level.
Bibliography


Oliver, Mary Beth. 2003. “African American Men as “Criminal and Dangerous”: Implications of Media Portrayals of Crime on the “Criminalization” of African


---

ii See Endnote 1
iv See Endnote 1
v Yogachandra, Natascha. May 2014. The Atlantic: Teaching Positive Masculinity
vii See Endnote 6