Comparative Study of the Mechanical Strength in Two Species of Ferns: Polystichum munitum and Pteridium aquilinum

Russell P. Baetiong
Pepperdine University

Victoria M. Lekson
Pepperdine University

Olivier B. Monty
Pepperdine University

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.pepperdine.edu/sturesearch

Part of the Plant Biology Commons

Recommended Citation
Comparative Study of the Mechanical Strength in Two Species of Ferns, Polystichum munitum and Pteridium aquilinum

Russell P. Baetiong, Victoria M. Lekson, Olivier B. Monty
Pepperdine University, Malibu, CA, 90263

Abstract

A comparative study of the mechanical strength in two species of ferns, the winter deciduous Pteridium aquilinum and the evergreen Polystichum munitum, was done. The mechanical strength of the leaf and stipe were used as a means for comparison. Additional data such as specific leaf mass (g/cm²) were also collected. The first hypothesis was that the evergreen fern would have higher leaf mechanical strength, while the second hypothesis was that there would be no difference in the mechanical strength of the stipe. The mechanical strength of the stipe was compared through the Modulus of Elasticity (MOE), while the leaf tensile strength was contrasted through the Modulus (Automatic) – both quantities having been determined with the Instron. The former comparison yielded a P-value of 0.1299 (P>0.05) for an unpaired t-test for equal variance, and the latter yielded P<0.01 for an unpaired t-test for unequal variances. There was thus no statistically significant evidence to reject our first hypothesis. Although the second comparison gave strong statistically significant difference, the direction of such difference was opposite to what had been predicted by our hypothesis. The deciduous leaf was found to have higher tensile strength than the evergreen one. This is contradictory to expectations and forces one to consider further studies to first confirm the discovery before possibly offering a rationale for the phenomenon.

Introduction

Originating in the Devonian, ferns are the second most diverse lineage next to angiosperms, comprising at least 10,000 species (Taylor et al., 2010; Wilson and Knoll, 2009). In fact, this family of plants exhibits remarkable habitat and morphological diversity, which explains its relative omnipresence. Furthermore, ferns have shown unparalleled resilience in the fierce competition for survival offered by the woody conifers and angiosperms. The latter have the advantage of height – and hence sunlight availability – and have deeper roots for the easier tapping of the water supply. Yet, ferns thrive and, as mentioned above, show impressive diversity. It would thus be most interesting to understand the properties that allow ferns to compete with angiosperms and conifers for resources like water in order to survive and remain abundant. However, Dr. Jarmila Pittermann from UC Santa Cruz mentions, not only are ferns shallowly understood when compared to angiosperms and conifers, but also are they a mystery as far as their ‘primitive’ vascular system is concerned (Pittermann, 2012). All we know for now is that Pteridophytes strike a balance between mechanical strength, hydraulic efficiency and height above the ground (Wilson and Knoll, 2010). We further know that ferns possess poorly reinforced tracheids for water transport, even less so than conifers. We also know that for about 10X less xylem area than a conifer twig, ferns support nearly equivalent leaf area as the latter (Watkins et al., 2010). This is indicative of high hydraulic efficiency, which is accounted for by the fact that, thanks to their smaller size, ferns are able to avoid sacrificing hydraulic capacity for mechanical strength in their tracheids (Watkins et al., 2010). This is unlike conifers, which have to make such sacrifices in order to support their ascension to greater heights. While studies comparing ferns and woody plants have been performed, little is known about the fern species itself. Intra-species variation in traits is of interest to scientists like Dr. Pittermann. This experiment was actually a contribution to the freshly started work of the latter on ferns. While she proposed to study hydraulic efficiency in ferns, the experiment was actually a contribution to the freshly started work of the latter on ferns. The fibrous material observed after the rupture point might be the explanation for the surprising greater tensile strength of the deciduous leaf of PA. Further support for this proposal comes from the observation that the leaf stretches somewhat when pulled on.

Discussion

The P<0.01 for the comparison of the leaf tensile strength (Figure 4) is completely contradictory to the prediction of the hypothesis and to the widespread knowledge of the superior tensile strength of evergreen leaves relative to deciduous leaves (Balsamo R.A., Willigen, 2003). An explanation for this might lie in Figures 1 and 2. As seen in Figure 1, Polystichum munitum (PN) has both an elastic and a plastic phase before a sudden break (vertical drop). Indeed, during the experimental procedure, a clean break was observed in the leaves of PN at the rupture point. Contrastingly, Pteridium aquilinum (PA) showed only an elastic phase before suddenly and incompletely rupturing. This is characteristic of a brittle material. The incomplete rupture gave the oscillations in the curve as shown in Figure 2 beyond the rupture point (black triangle). In fact, during the experimental procedure, fibrous attachments were observed after the rupture point (black triangle) as the leaf ruptured unevenly.

Works Cited


Discussion

The P<0.01 for the comparison of the leaf tensile strength (Figure 4) is completely contradictory to the prediction of the hypothesis and to the widespread knowledge of the superior tensile strength of evergreen leaves relative to deciduous leaves (Balsamo R.A., Willigen, 2003). An explanation for this might lie in Figures 1 and 2. As seen in Figure 1, Polystichum munitum (PN) has both an elastic and a plastic phase before a sudden break (vertical drop). Indeed, during the experimental procedure, a clean break was observed in the leaves of PN at the rupture point. Contrastingly, Pteridium aquilinum (PA) showed only an elastic phase before suddenly and incompletely rupturing. This is characteristic of a brittle material. The incomplete rupture gave the oscillations in the curve as shown in Figure 2 beyond the rupture point (black triangle). In fact, during the experimental procedure, fibrous attachments were observed after the rupture point (black triangle) as the leaf ruptured unevenly.

The fibrous material observed after the rupture point might be the explanation for the surprising greater tensile strength of the deciduous leaf of PA. Further support for this proposal comes from the observation that the leaf stretches somewhat when pulled on.

Conclusion

Hence, we agree with Dr. Jarmila Pittermann when she says that not enough is known about ferns. In this experiment, even the widespread knowledge of evergreen leaves having more tensile strength than deciduous leaves has been challenged. The reality of the angiosperm and coniferous worlds do not seem to apply to that of the fern world. Further investigations will be necessary to understand ferns better. A potential further experiment related to this one is to analyze the material that makes up the leaves of Pteridium aquilinum. This might reveal the identity of the fibrous material observed, assuming it is indeed real.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Dr. Stephen Davis for his advice and dedication to mentoring our project. Furthermore, we would like to thank Dr. Jarmila Pittermann of UC Santa Cruz for providing the fern specimens studied.

Results

Figure 1. Plot of normalized Tensile stress versus Tensile strain for leaflets plucked from a frond of a plant of the species Polystichum munitum (PN). The elastic and plastic phases of deformation are clearly visible before sudden and complete rupture of the leaf.

Figure 2. Plot of normalized Tensile stress versus Tensile strain for leaflets plucked from a frond of a plant of the species Pteridium aquilinum (PA). Despite an explainable non linear beginning, the elastic phase is visible, before sudden incomplete initial rupture as the plot oscillates before finally dropping to zero at complete rupture.

Figure 3. The mean MOE of the stipes of the two fern species, Polystichum munitum (PN) and Pteridium aquilinum (PA) were compared using an unpaired t-test for equal variances, which gave P>0.05. There was no statistically significant difference.

Figure 4. The mean Leaf Modulus (Automatic) for the two fern species, Polystichum munitum (PA) and Pteridium aquilinum (PA) were compared using an unpaired t-test for unequal variances, which gave P<0.01. There was a strong statistically significant difference.

Figure 5. The mean leaf thickness of the two fern species, Polystichum munitum (PN) and Pteridium aquilinum (PA) were compared using an unpaired t-test for equal variances, which gave P<0.01. There was a strong statistically significant difference.

Figure 6. Left, cross section of Pteridium aquilinum stipe. Right, cross section of Polystichum munitum stipe.